

HENNET CSO Memoranda 2024 On the Public Participation Bill (No. 52 of 2023)

Presented to The Parliamentary Broadcasting and Library Committee of the 13th Parliament of Kenya Copied to S. Njoroge, CBS, Clerk of the National Assembly

Date: 13th February 2024

CIVIL SOCIETY INPUTS AND COMMENTS

Introduction

This memorandum is submitted following a Public Notice dated 26th January by the National Assembly 13th Parliament in the matter of consideration by the national assembly of the public participation Bill (National Assembly Bill No. 52 of 2023).

Health	NGOs Network (HE	NNET)		
S/No.	Regulation/Clause	Issue of Concern	Justification	Recommendation
	Title	The title of the Bill	Change the Name of the Bill to "The Civic Education and Public Participation Bill 2023"	Civic education and public participation are closely linked and intertwined. They are like two sides of the same coin. Importantly, it not possible to have meaningful public participation without civic education. In the event that it is not possible to change the name of the Bill in its current form, then specific clauses on civic education should still be included in the Bill to ensure that civic education is adequately considered and covered.
	Long Title	The long title of the Bill	Change the long title to include Article 174(c) and (d) of the Constitution of Kenya	The Bill has listed some Articles of the Constitution of Kenya of relevance to public participation but has excluded a key constitutional Article o relevance to public participation in the contex of devolution namely the provisions of Article 174(c) and (d) of the Constitution of Kenya. This Article is necessary because the Bill if passed into law will regulate public participation at the two levels of government.
	Part I Preliminary	Definition of public participation	The definition is limiting and excludes other programs that are not legislative but require public participation such as the budget process	Recommend the adoption of the definition in the Draft Public Participation Policy that states, "public participation refers

HENNET CSOs Comments on the Public Participation Bill, 2023

		and electoral processes	to the process by which citizens, as individuals, groups or communities (also known as stakeholders), take part in the conduct of public affairs, interact with the state and other non-state actors to influence decisions, policies, programs, legislation and provide oversight in service delivery, development and other matters concerning their governance and public interest, either directly or through freely chosen representatives
Section 2: Interpretation	Cabinet Secretary	The law should provide that the Cabinet Secretary responsible for implementation is the Cabinet Secretary responsible for Public Service	Since public participation is one of the national values of governance, and taking into consideration that Public Service Commission is responsible for implementation of the values, the law should give this responsibility to Public Service Ministry. In designing performance of National Government and supporting the County Governments, the Public Service Commission would therefore inclusion of public participation as one of the components in performance measurement. This will also ensure stability in implementation of the Act since trends have showed that Public Service Commission has always been a ministry in all governments unlike Justice. At most counties level, this function is under Departments for Public Service hence this approach would promote uniformity
Section 2: Interpretation	Public participation	The definition of public participation should include "planning, budgeting, monitoring, evaluation and auditing"	For full realization of the provisions of Article 1 of the Constitution on retention of the sovereign power by

		as part of the decision- making processes for citizen engagement in decision making processes.	citizens in their governance and fulfillment of the provision of public participation as a principle and value of governance under Article 10 of the Constitution, the law should be explicit that the citizens shall be included in all levels of governance including the "planning, budgeting, monitoring, evaluation and auditing".
Section 4: Objects of the Act	Add clause (e)	Include an objective on civic education for enabling or promotion of public participation.	Civic education is important ingredient for public participation. It is therefore important to integrate civic education into this Bill since the Government can't promote public participation without conducting civic education.
Section 5: Scope of public participation	Clauses a, b, c and d	Change clauses 5(a), (b) and (c) to Include implementation and (b) to also incorporate participation in planning, that is, A). "Formulation and implementation of policies"; B). Planning C). Planning budgeting and financial management D). Making and implementation of laws. Also add sub-clause d). to provide for public participation in oversight processes including financial audits and overall service delivery	The import of the proposed changes is to integrate citizen Participation in all processes of public governance from policy making, planning, budgeting, implementation of plans and budgets, and financial and services delivery processes in line with Article 1 of the Kenyan Constitution.
Section 6: Conduct of public participation	Section (2)	processes Include a section on (f) on interest and relevance of stakeholders	In Kenya major stakeholders have been biased by state organs in public participation whereby the organs have been undertaking direct consultations with the citizens /general public. By having two tiers of consultations will allow stakeholders to be consulted first before the public are consulted.

Part	Section 6	Public Participation	The Bill suggests 'reasonable and meaningful' as the standard for all participation opportunities extended by state agencies. In its current form however, the lack of a clear definition or threshold for 'meaningful' opportunities sets the success of the new bill in doubt. The strength of any legislation on public participation stems from how well it can provide a framework for 'meaningful' participation and, in doing so, boldly set a course for an inclusive, participatory democracy.	While the threshold for 'reasonable' is left to state agencies to determine, considerations of reasonability proposed are the nature of the legislation or decision, its importance to and impact on the public, as well as the need for inclusive and effective representation. Recommendation: Add Clause 6(f) to state "the state organ shall in providing meaningful and reasonable opportunities be required to conduct public participation in all the 47 counties in the case that the subject matter impacts all citizens.
	Section 12(1)		All reports for all public participation should be availed and not selected few.	Recommend addition of the world 'ALL' "Each state organ or public office shall prepare, publish, and disseminate to the public using appropriate channels, the annual report on all public participation.
	Section 12 (4)		The section outlines the specific elements to be included in the report, aiming for comprehensive coverage. However, its brevity may inadvertently restrict the scope. Enhancements are needed to ensure all relevant aspects are adequately addressed.	 Recommend the addition of the following. Summary of all parties that participated in the said notice for public participation. Summary of feedback collected and report on what was considered, what was not considered and reasons for not consideration. Demographic analysis of the number of people engaged. Summary engagement methods used; barriers

			 of participation encountered. 6. The call for public participation and the responses on the same by public including matters raised which were outside the focus area. 7. For descending voices or supports, there is a need for the threshold of the proportion which is of supporting or contrary opinion on the
General public guidelines 2(1)	A state organ or public office shall be given adequate notice to make their input on the issue	Adequate notice is ambiguous and can be misinterpreted	matter. The timeframe should be specified and clearly indicated in the clause. Recommend notice not less than 21 days
			Recommend insertion of (h) Organized networks and coalition groups.
General public guidelines 3(2)	Shall take 'all necessary measures' to ensure the participation of persons with disability in public participation process	Majority of these persons might be left out in the processes due to inconsistent implementation of the clause due to lack of clarity on the necessary measures to be affected	Improve by being more specific on what all necessary measure entail and enforcement mechanism consequences of noncompliance.
General public guidelines 3(3)			Where the targeted participants are not conversant with the national languages, the state organ or public office shall provide an interpreter for those participants who wish to make their remarks in their local language and sign language when required. Recommend the addition of sign language
			sign language.
General Public Participation Guideline 3(4)	A state organ shall give the public adequate notice to make their input on issues	Decision on timeframe will still be at the discretion of the state organ as it is currently	Specific bare minimum timeline should be provided. Recommend a time not less than 21 days.

	Clause (5)	We reaffirm Cabinet Secretaries as	This is because
	Clause (J)	the responsible officers	Cabinet Secretaries
			should have Authority
			over their Ministries
		The Government Department to	
		be responsible for implementation o	
		the law should be Public Service	
		Commission and not Ministry	Public Participation. We
		of Justice, whereby the law custodian	
		is the Attorney General	Ministry of Justice and I don't trust that the AG can
			effectively spearhead
			lead Public Participation.
			Public Participation is
			one of the values of
			governance and we were
			in a meeting where it was
			indicated that overseeing
			implementation of the
			values is the responsibility of PSC. We
			believe that with an
			effective and strong PSC,
			Public Participation could
			be integrated into
			performance
			management with clear
			indicators.
			That the implementation
			of the bill should be
			charged on an
			independent body to coordinate public
			coordinate public participation (PP) and
			Civic Education (CE) and
			ensure compliance.
			Same as Commission on
			Administrative Justice is
			for the Access to
			Information Act.
			Government Ministry will never be keen to ensure
			compliance when its
			matters Civic Education
			(CE) and public
			participation (PP) to
Section 12	Section 12 (1)	Reporting by the responsible	citizens. Each year the Ministry
		Ministry and Cabinet Secretary	should produce and
			publicize an annual report
			on public participation
			inclusive of a section of
			the financial expenditures
Schedule	Section	Include also virtual option	To carter for those not
1			present and those in the
	(2)		diasnora
	(2) Subsection (3) (d)		diaspora

Section (5)	There should be no charge for public	If a charge is included
subsection (5) (3) (b)	information	it will limit the right to access to
		information and the ate organ may describe unreasonable figures to limit that same rights
Section (5) subsection		by state organs and
(3) (c)	Protected by law.	public offices to Deny information hence
		violation of the right to public information.
Section (5)	This section should be removed.	Unreasonable circumstances is not defined by any law
subsection (4) (a)		subject to wrong interpretation and hence
		might be used to violate the right to information
Section	Remove Confidentiality requirements	These requirements will limit the right to information and
(5) subsection (4) (b)		hence they should be done away with.
Section	The nature and extent should be removed	This is ambiguous and not specified in any law
(5) subsection (5)		or regulations and might be used to deny public information.
Section	Remove the limitations by the nature and extent specified under this	
(8) sub	section	hence it an ambiguous and an hindrance to the right to
section (3)	The bill does not	freedom of expression This should be included if
	have redress mechanism and we	any of the procedures is violated it
	recommend a whole section to be included	can be corrected before the next procedure is taken. This will reduce petitions or ligation which occurs after the whole
		public participation process is undertaken. This will reduce costs and time spend on
		petitions and litigations This will ensure validation, review, monitoring and evaluation of the process
		of public participation

General Comments

- Civic Education is one of the major National and County Government functions as stipulated in the Constitution and the County Government Act. Civic education is not mentioned anywhere in the bill. It is our considered view that civic education precedes any bill set for public participation, hence we recommend a whole part of the bill to include civic education and budget allocation on it. This will make the people participate in meaningfully in the public participation process.
- 2. Outline a linkage between other Acts and this Bill such as role of Public Participation in the PFM Act
- 3. Alongside this Bill, other legal frameworks such as the Draft Public Participation Policy 2018 should be harmonized

The bill still lacks clear measurement variables for the following key issues: We recommend inclusion of schedule with the threshold of the following variables

No.	Variable	Measurable Threshold	Indicators
1.	Minimum standards comprises adequate, effective and meaningful participation especially at the community level	Attendance at ward level meeting	500 people
		Attendance at sub- county level meeting	2,000 people
		Attendance at County level meeting	8,000 People
2.	Inadequate framework for ensuring the effective participation and involvement of the relevant stakeholders, marginalized, vulnerable and minority groups in county governance and development	Letters of invitations to all stakeholder categories (CSOs, private sector, NGOs, women, youth, MSEs, Trade Unions, FBOs, Squatters, etc)	At least 10 invitation letters to 10 categories of stakeholders
	-	Submission of memorandums	At least 10 memorandums from 10 categories of stakeholders
3.	Inadequate safeguards of public interest in public participation processes	No. of views or memorandums submitted	At least half of the public views submitted are incorporated in the final document
4.	Inadequate complaint handling, reporting & feedback mechanisms	Validation meetings are held	For every public hearing a validation meeting is held to ensure view are incorporated and if not included, reasons and justification is provided in writing and verbal

Additional sections:

 Include a section after the title section regarding Public participation and related rights and Duty of both National and County Governments their Responsibilities of County and Decentralized Units (CoK Articles 176 (2), 184 and 186 & 4, Schedule Part 2 (14), 187 and 189, CGA Section 48, UA&C Act 2011 - Urban (city, municipality, town and market) units, Sub County, Ward, Village units)

- Include a schedule: on Inter-Governmental and Inter-Agency Coordination defining the roles which include Kenya national commission of human rights, Kenya Communication Authority, Inter-Governmental Relations Technical Committee (IGTRC), NGO coordination board, Commission of Administrative Justice, (CAJ), Ministry of Interior and National Coordination etc. This will define their roles and linkages to public participation and civic education.
- 3. **Include a schedule** on: Notification procedures: This should be 21 day notice for all public participation hearings with all adequate information released together with the Notification
- 4. **Include a schedule**: on Protection for persons (whistle-blowers) who may disclose or release information in good faith that they reasonably believe, at the time of disclosure, to be true and of public interest against legal, administrative or disciplinary sanctions.

Conclusion

We hope that you will review, address, and include our concerns raised in this memo.

We also anticipate a published report of this exercise on the same.

Yours faithfully,

mklubaale

Dr. Margaret Lubaale Executive Director, ED

Health NGO's Network (HENNET) AMREF KCO, along Wilson Airport, Off Langata Road Address: P.O Box 30125-00100, Nairobi, Kenya Email: <u>director@hennet.or.ke | admin@hennet.or.ke | programs@hennet.or.ke</u> Phone:+254796785973+254792906273 www.hennet.or.ke | Twitter@HennetKenya| Facebook:@Hennet17.Kenya

This memo is submitted on behalf of Registered HENNET Member Organizations